HUD CoC Committee Minutes
Tuesday, February 16th, 2021
2:00 p.m. - 4:30 p.m.

Meetings are public. Homeless and formerly homeless Alameda County residents are especially encouraged to attend. Public Comment will be taken at the beginning of each meeting and is limited to 2 minutes per person. Click here to learn more about the public participation policy.

HUD CoC Members Present: Paulette Franklin (Alameda County Behavioral Health Care Services), Marnelle Timson (Consumer), Riley Wilkerson (Alameda County Housing and Community Development), Lara Tannenbaum (City of Oakland), C’Mone Falls (City of Oakland), Tunisia Owens (Family Violence Law Center), Josh Jacobs (City of Berkeley)

EveryOne Home Staff Present: Ja’Nai Aubry, Chelsea Andrews, Jessie Shimmin, Alexis Lozano, Dorcas Chang

Members of the Public: Patrick Crosby (Alameda County Housing and Community Development), Lucy Kasdin (Alameda County Healthcare for the Homeless/HCSA), Noah Brod (U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development), Jordane Tofighi (International Rescue Committee Oakland), Andy Duong (Alameda County Housing and Community Development), Kseniya Povroznik (Five Keys)

Absent: Wendy Jackson (East Oakland Community Project)

1. Welcome (C’Mone Falls, HUD CoC Chair) 2:00-2:15pm
   a. C’Mone Falls asked everyone at the meeting to introduce themselves and share how they are connected to homelessness.

2. HUD CoC Public Comment 2:15-2:25pm
   a. No public comment.

3. Approval of Meeting Minutes, #1- 1.19.21 and 1.4.21 2:25-2:35pm
   a. Lara Tannenbaum (City of Oakland) made motion to approve the Special Meeting Minutes on January 19, 2021. Marnelle Timson (Consumer) seconded.
      i. C’Mone Falls – yes
      ii. Lara Tannenbaum – yes
      iii. Marnelle Timson – yes
      iv. Tunisia Owens – yes
      v. Riley Wilkerson – yes
      vi. Paulette Franklin – yes
      vii. Motion passed.
   b. Josh Jacobs (City of Berkeley) made motion to approve the January 4, 2021 minutes. Paulette Franklin (BHCS) seconded.
      i. Josh Jacobs – yes
ii. C'Mone Falls – Yes
iii. Lara Tannenbaum – Yes
iv. Marnelle Timson – yes
v. Tunisia Owens – yes
vi. Riley Wilkerson – Abstained due to absence.
vii. Paulette Franklin – Abstained due to absence.
viii. Motion passed.

4. Committee Survey (Ja’Nai) 2:40-2:45pm
   a. Ja’Nai Aubry (EveryOne Home) will send a committee survey to the HUD CoC Committee after the meeting. The committee has until next Tuesday (2/23) to respond. The survey will provide committee members an opportunity to provide feedback.

5. Homeless System Updates (All) 2:45-3:00pm
   a. No updates.

6. Youth Action Board (Hannah) 3:00-3:10pm
   a. This agenda item was removed because Hannah Moore was absent.

7. Election of Paul Berry 3:10-3:20pm
   a. This agenda item was removed because Paul Berry was absent.

8. Project Roomkey/ Homekey Updates (Lucy Kasdin) 3:20-3:35pm
   a. Lucy Kasdin (Healthcare for the Homeless) presented Project Roomkey/Homekey Updates to the committee on behalf of the Office of Homeless Care and Coordination.
      i. In January/February, clients will be transitioning out of Safer Ground sites into housing.
      ii. As more sites are brought on and as the County works with Oakland, they want to continue to pay attention to the demographics of who they are bringing in and serving in the next phase.
      iii. Biggest update is that the Homekey hotels that were purchased (Comfort and Days Hotels in Oakland) will be transitioning over time into Permanent Supportive Housing (PSH).
      iv. Due to President Biden’s Executive Order, FEMA will provide 100% reimbursement for non-congregate shelter. The closing of Project Roomkey sites has been put on hold. Two sites were closed at the end of December/January and people from that site have transitioned to other projects in Project Roomkey Safer Ground.
      v. HCSA is developing a streamlined referral process to determine eligibility, wrap to sites based on region, determine who has openings, determine where an individual is on the PSH list, etc.
      vi. Lessons learned include being clear with both site operators and people served when sites are closing that this is an active process of engaging in housing navigation.
vii. If this approach is approved, they will share with HUD CoC where the final agreement is for eligibility, the communication for referrals and a clear timeline.

b. Questions/Discussions:

i. Chelsea Andrews (EOH) asked what ‘Place Not Meant For Habitation’ Category means and about the racial breakdown of outcomes for individuals served.
   1. ‘Place Not Meant For Habitation’ means return to homelessness.
   2. Lucy Kasdin provides clarity that 606 refer to the total number of individuals that have exited the program so far; of that total 388 have exited to permanent housing as opposed to “places not meant for habitation”.
   3. Lucy Kasdin will request the disaggregated data for the racial breakdowns.

ii. C'Mone Falls (City of Oakland) asked for more context regarding the people who did not exit into Permanent Housing.
   1. There is no information but anecdotally people left for a variety of reasons.

iii. Once Lucy Kasdin confirms with Kerry Abbott, she will send the slides to Ja’Nai to share with the committee.

iv. C'Mone Falls (City of Oakland) asked what the setup for two hotels that will be converted to Permanent Housing is.
   1. Lucy Kasdin (HCSA) answered that C'Mone Falls will have to ask Kerry Abbott and believes the conversion will take some time.

v. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) asked regarding Biden’s executive order, if the County can get the 25% they billed for the hotels and how long will the executive order last?
   1. Lucy Kasdin (HCSA) will find out about the reimbursement and stated that the executive order will go through September 2021.

vi. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) asked for context on the multiple-races category in the Safer Ground demographics data.
   1. This data speaks to the importance of looking at referrals more intentionally in the next round and as Jessie mentioned, this may also reflect that we need to improve data collection for this demographic.

vii. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) asked how the lessons learned will be applied to the COVID-19 vaccine roll out?
   1. HCSA is creating a multipronged approach that is centralized. Part of this approach includes working with shelters to serve as hubs for encampments, having field-based teams go out and provide vaccines directly, understanding historical trauma and why people are hesitant to receive a vaccine, and providing multiple access points to the vaccine.
2. Noah Brod (HUD) shared that HUD has guidance on what Care Acts funds can be used for facilitating vaccine distribution.

9. **System Performance Measures**

   3:35-3:55pm


      i. The System Performance Measures are due to HUD on/or before March 1st. The measures run on the HUD year (10/1/2019 – 9/30/2020)

      ii. The Safer Ground sites are now included in the performance measures data, so there is a now a more comprehensive picture of our performance.

      iii. The seven measures are reported to HUD by every Continuum of Care (CoC) annually. Measure 6 is reserved for high performing CoCs and does not apply to our CoC.

   iv. Measure 1 is the length of time homeless.

      1. Measure 1a looks at how effective our system is at ending homelessness.

         a. On average, it takes 204 nights to end people’s homelessness, but the median is 136 nights or fewer.

         b. The average is larger than the median because there is a lot of people with long lengths of time of homelessness.

         c. Our system model is built on the aspiration that in a highly effective system, people would be homeless for 90 days or less.

         d. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) made a comment that HUD sets the bar really high for high performing CoCs. To be considered a high performing CoC, the average length of time homeless must be 20 nights or less.

   v. Measure 2 looks at whether interventions are effective and long lasting in ending homelessness. It looks at people who exited to permanent housing two years prior to see if they returned to homelessness in the subsequent two years.

      1. From 2015 to 2020, our system has about 17-18% of people returning to homelessness. There is an anomaly in the data for 2018, that might be due to changes to our system.

      2. There are racial disparities, for example there are higher rates of returns to homelessness for people who identify as black/African American, American Indian or Alaska Native, and Multi-Racial.

   vi. Measure 3 is the number of homeless persons in our system.

      1. After the Safer Ground sites were included, there was an increase of 1300 in the number of people served by an emergency shelter.

         a. Marnelle Timson (Consumer) – asked why there is no data included for Operation Comfort.
i. The Operation Comfort hotels were primarily for people who were COVID-positive. Some of the guests were homeless but not all. However, data is being gathered from these hotels.

ii. Homelessness was an eligibility requirement for the Safer Ground sites.

b. Lucy Kasdin asked before Safer Ground opened, how much did the Emergency Shelter data change.
   i. When Jessie ran the numbers without Safer Ground included, there was a 1027 increase.
   ii. Even though there was decompression of shelters, there was still an increase of people served in shelters.
   iii. The dip on the graph has more to do with length of time homeless increasing before beds could be added, than any kind of inventory issue.

c. C'Mone Falls (City of Oakland) asked for the definition of Safe Haven (SH).
   i. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) answered that the idea of Safe Havens is that they use a low threshold approach. But HUD has decreased funding for this intervention over time.
   ii. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) added that they have no end dates, people come and go, and there is an indefinite stay. He does not believe that the Veterans Affairs (VA) is using them the same way that HUD originally designed it for.

vii. Measure 4 looks at Employment and Income Growth.
   a. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) asked the group what they thought about the trend and said that it could be a result of many variables such as data quality issue, stagnation of benefits, etc.
   b. Patrick Crosby (HCD) suggested that part of the trend could be emphasis on moving from General Assistance (GA) to Supplemental Security Income (SSI).
   c. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) added that the trend might mean that we are doing better. The stayers are increasing their income and the leavers are a combination of those who successfully move to PH and unsuccessful who go to homelessness - a combination of those who drags that number down. The fact that the numbers are getting closer shows that we are focusing on the right things.
viii. Measure 5 looks at First Time Homelessness by tracking if an individual entered Emergency Shelter (ES), Transitional Housing (TH), Rapid Re-Housing (RRH), and Permanent Supportive Housing (PSH) in the last two years.

1. With Safer Ground, this number changed by about 500.
2. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) brings attention to the number of people who are experiencing first time homelessness in 2020 and asked what could be impacting it. Some ideas could be Alameda County’s eviction moratoria or access/lack of access to the system during COVID-19.
3. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) will continue to disaggregate the data but could not get the numbers to align before the meeting.

ix. Measure 7 looks at Exits to or Retention of Permanent Housing.

1. Of the number of people who exited to permanent housing from ES, SH, TH, and RRH, 35% went to PH which is proportionally a low point but not bad in terms of actual numbers of people obtaining housing.
2. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) pointed out that a substantial amount of people were housed. The system does work but there is not enough housing. This needs to be more of the narrative.
3. C’Mone Falls (City of Oakland) also suggested that it may be beneficial to show the actual number that the percentages represent.
4. Noah Brod (HCD) suggested that another way to look at the data is that this is an intervention with an 85 percent success rate.
5. In the data disaggregated by race, you can see some of the geographical impacts of where our services are, that most of TH is in the Oakland area so the data looks closer to Oakland’s number than our system number.
6. Lucy Kasdin (Healthcare for the Homeless/HCSA) asked if the data includes Safer Ground and asked if so why, the Emergency Shelter (ES) number is just over 1000.
   a. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) answered that it does include Safer Ground and that this is only exits to permanent housing from ES.

x. Takeaway is that the data will be impacted for at least three years by the pandemic. There are longer lengths of homelessness. There are still racial disparities in returns to homelessness but access to programs and exits to housing does not show racial disparities.

xi. Patrick Crosby (HCD) added that he, C’Mone Falls and other city Oakland staff did some work on looking at the multi-racial population. If you redistribute that population based on their race choices, you can get a significantly different picture of that distribution. Looking at their selection and however you want to readjust the balance to see how it tips / moves the numbers quite a bit.

xii. Tunisia Owens (FVLC) added that due to structural racism, it is what people see on the outside that matters more than how people perceive themselves. Even if
the numbers shift, an individual that identifies as multiracial may still be experiencing structural racism and experience some disconnect between their identity and the identity assigned to them.

xiii. C'Mone Falls (City of Oakland) clarified that the work on the multi-racial population would not be submitted in this format but just a way to analyze different ideas and concepts and that there’s benefits to that.

xiv. Josh Jacobs (City of Berkeley) made motion to approve the system performance measures. C'Mone Falls (City of Oakland) seconded.

xv. Tunisia Owens – yes
xvi. Josh Jacobs – yes
xvii. Marnelle Timson - yes
xviii. Paulette Franklin - yes
xix. C'Mone Falls – yes
xx. Riley Wilkerson – yes
xxi. Motion passed.

10. HMIS Vaccine Tracking          3:55-4:00pm

a. Jessie Shimmin (EOH) shared with the committee that HMIS Oversight is considering how HMIS can be used to assist with COVID-19 vaccine distribution for people experiencing homelessness and what roles homeless providers may play. There is a lot of interest from the HMIS Oversight Committee to ensure that people experiencing homelessness have access to the vaccine and that they will get both doses.

b. HUD indicated that HMIS would be an appropriate tool to use depending on the community’s vaccine distribution plan. HMIS Oversight is remaining attentive to that.

c. HMIS oversight will keep you apprised of how that unfolds. If HUD CoC committee members have any feedback let Jessie know.

11. Sheltered PIT/HIC Count (Patrick/ Andy)       4:00-4:10pm

a. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) shared that 37 out of 44 CoCs decided not to do an unsheltered Point in Time count which included all Bay Area CoCs and thanked committee members for agreeing to the PIT advisory board’s recommendations. He will share a report on the California PIT count with Ja’Nai Aubry to share with the committee.

b. Patrick Crosby (HCD) stated that from a conversation with William Snow from HUD last week, HUD understands that we would continue to count our shelters with the capacity we had last year, show them as underutilized and add Safer Ground hotels as new units to this year’s count. The numbers will balance out to some extent and give us visibility for both populations. Patrick also had the impression that HUD is going to be more lenient and accepting of responses that are at 50% because of the decompression of shelters and letting the clients stay at the Safer Ground hotels. William is also going to talk to the Longitudinal Systems Analysis (LSA) team about how the Housing Inventory Count will impact LSA data.
c. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) added that the main takeaway is that COVID may have long term impacts on our performance measures. We will have either low shelter occupancy rates because of the decompression of shelters or have more shelters exiting people from sheltered homelessness to another form of sheltered homeless because of the exits to COVID hotels. William Snow said that this is consistent with other California communities and the COVID hotels.

12. NOFA Update (Ja’Nai) 4:10-4:15pm
a. Ja’Nai Aubry (EOH) provided an update on HUD’s CoC Program Notice of Funding Availability (NOFA).
   i. There is no competition this year. Every program that was granted funding in FY2019 will be renewed and there are no opportunities for new projects, expansions, or similar changes.
   
   b. Riley Wilkerson (HCD) added that programs that provide rental assistance will receive increased funding because the Fair Market Rate (FMR) increased in our community.

   c. Noah Brod (HUD) added that consolidations are not allowed this year.

13. Governance Update (Ja’Nai) 4:15-4:25pm
a. Ja’Nai Aubry (EOH) gave an update on the Governance workgroup.
   i. There is a governance workgroup that includes the Leadership Board Chair, HUD CoC Chair, representatives from HCSA, HCD, people with lived experience, 5 cities, and service providers.
   
   ii. The governance committee are meeting weekly to discuss changes that should be made in response to the strategic retreat to center racial equity, ensure there are more leadership opportunities for people with lived experience, and provide greater clarity on the purpose of our committees and how they all work together.
   
   iii. There will be additional opportunities for people who are not on the working group or Leadership Board to provide feedback through listening sessions.
   
   iv. The working group will share their recommendations with the Leadership Board to vote on in March and then the approved proposal will be presented to the full CoC Membership in April. EveryOne Home will keep HUD CoC updated on dates.

b. Chelsea Andrews (EOH) added the goal is to get to a point where everyone is in alignment and in full support of the governance structure. She also shared that the governance committee reviewed survey results from the Leadership Board to see what the board wants to be more involved with. Some of the work the HUD CoC does is of interest to the board members. EveryOne Home expects that this will be a work in progress as we move forward with the governance restructure discussion and will keep HUD CoC Committee updated.

14. Announcements and Next Meeting/Agenda 4:25-4:30pm
   c. Next Meeting: March 16, 2021 2:00-4:30