Results-Based Accountability Committee  
March 2, 2020  
City of Oakland Human Services Department  
150 Frank Ogawa Plaza  
4th Floor, Conference Room 1  
Oakland, CA

Present: Julian Leiserson (AbS), Daphine Lamb-Perrilliat (EBHO), Alexis Lozano (EOH), Jessica Shimmin (EOH), Myisha Steward (City of Oakland), Emily Darrenthal (City of Oakland), Andy Duong (HMIS), Melvin Cowan (BOSS), Taj Mahal Payne, Sara Erickson (RCD), Zoxie Brew (AC3), Heather Grow (Open Heart Kitchen), Mike Keller (EOCP), Miguel Dwin (ACHRC), Julie Hadnot (All In), Brittany Carnegie (City of Berkeley)

1. Welcome and Introductions
   - RBA Committee is an open committee and welcomes participation from anyone committed to learning and implementing the RBA framework
   - Next RBA Meeting: 2–4 PM on Monday April 6, at Conference Room 1, 4th Floor, 150 Frank Ogawa Plaza, Oakland.

2. Presentation on Housing Inventory Count
   - Andy Duong shares list of organizations that haven’t responded to his inquiry
   - HIC is due April 1, 2020

3. HMIS Restructure of Coordinated Entry
   - Training likely to begin in April
   - The HUD data elements will make it possible for

4. System Modeling
   - If this is about racial equity, then lift that up.
   - Where are the impact fees that have been collected re: affordable housing.

5. Next Steps
   - AbS broke ground on buildings in Fremont and in Sta Clara, which is exciting!
   - Please let me know
System Modeling
Leadership Committee

Oakland/Berkeley/Alameda County CoC

February 28, 2020
Agenda

- Welcome & Introductions
- Annual Estimates of Households Experiencing Homelessness
- Review of Initial Inventory Recommendations
- Next steps
Disparities in Opportunity

Home Owners Loan Corporation Map, 1937
Disparities in Outcomes

Persistence of Neighborhood Poverty by Census Tract

Source: CAPE, with data from Geolytics Neighborhood Change Database, 1970-1990; Census 2000; and American Community Survey 2013 5-year files.
Advancing Equity

EQUALITY

EQUITY
Equity Analysis

• An equity approach is necessary to ending homelessness because of the racial disparities in the homeless population.

• An equity analysis examines disaggregated outcome data for disparities and information gathered by listening deeply to those most impacted by disparities.

• Both forms of data are used to identify what different or additional services are needed to close disparities.

• This information shapes recommended action; including which disparity each action is targeting and how impact/outcomes of changes would be measured.
Impact of Equity Analysis on Modeling

- Significant shift towards permanent subsidy in Shallow Subsidy, Dedicated Affordable Housing and PSH recommendations
  - Rethink time limited supports like Rapid Rehousing
- Changes in program models
  - Prevention and diversion models looking at assistance to the whole household not just the household experiencing homelessness
  - Remove rule that assistance resource can only be accessed once in a lifetime
- Strong support for focus on equity
  - Providers already looking at their data to identify disparities
  - Leaders shifting discussion about homelessness
  - Engaging new communities and organizations
A common concern was that rapid rehousing only provided temporary assistance:

“I want to have a permanent residence and if it’s not subsidized I don’t want it. What’s the use if I can’t afford it? What happens after 1 year if I don’t have the money? I end up right back where I started. I’m on SSDI and can’t work. Then everything you accumulate in the year, your personal belongings, get left behind.” – African American senior participant
Annual Estimate of Households Experiencing Homelessness
Annual Estimate of Unduplicated People

- Used the weekly rate of inflow from 2019 Point in Time (PIT) Count surveys to adjust the one-day count of persons experiencing homelessness to an annual count
- Calculated households using average household size

- Estimate that 15,786 unduplicated people are homeless in a year
- Estimate that 985 households with minor children are homeless in a year
- Estimate that 12,005 adult only households are homeless in a year
- Estimate that 144 households with unaccompanied minors are homeless in a year

NOTE: Modeling only conducted for households with minor children and adult only households.
## Annual Estimates by Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographical Regions</th>
<th>Percent of PIT</th>
<th>Estimated Number of People Experiencing Homelessness</th>
<th>Total Households</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>East County (Livermore, Pleasanton, Dublin)</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>679</td>
<td>565</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-County (Hayward, San Leandro, Alameda)</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>2,920</td>
<td>2,430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North County (Berkeley, Albany, Emeryville)</td>
<td>16.5%</td>
<td>2,605</td>
<td>2,167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>50.7%</td>
<td>8,004</td>
<td>6,659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South County (Fremont, Union City, Newark)</td>
<td>10.0%</td>
<td>1,579</td>
<td>1,313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
<td><strong>15,786</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,135</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Annual Household Type Estimate by Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographical Regions</th>
<th>Adult Only Households</th>
<th>Households with Minor Children</th>
<th>Households with Only Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>People</td>
<td>Hshlds</td>
<td>People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hshlds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East County (Livermore, Pleasanton, Dublin)</td>
<td>542</td>
<td>516</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-County (Hayward, San Leandro, Alameda)</td>
<td>2,332</td>
<td>2,221</td>
<td>561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North County (Berkeley, Albany, Emeryville)</td>
<td>2,080</td>
<td>1,981</td>
<td>502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>6,391</td>
<td>6,087</td>
<td>1,538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South County (Fremont, Union City, Newark)</td>
<td>1,261</td>
<td>1,201</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>12,606</td>
<td>12,005</td>
<td>3,035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Demographic and Economic Characteristics of Households Experiencing Homelessness

- **African American**: 11% General Population, 47% Homeless Population
- **American Indian or Alaska Native**: 1% General Population, 4% Homeless Population
- **Asian**: 2% General Population, 32% Homeless Population
- **Multi-Racial**: 2% General Population, 14% Homeless Population
- **Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander**: 1% General Population, 2% Homeless Population
- **White**: 50% General Population, 31% Homeless Population
- **Hispanic/Latinx**: 22% General Population, 17% Homeless Population
- **Non-Hispanic/Non-Latinx**: 75% General Population, 83% Homeless Population

- **Legend**:
  - Blue: Alameda County General Population (U.S. Census Bureau, 2010-2018 QuickFacts)
  - Orange: Homeless Population (PIT Count, 2019)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit Size</th>
<th>Cost per Month (2020 FMR)</th>
<th>Income Needed for Housing Costs at 30% of Income</th>
<th>Income Needed for Housing Costs at 50% of Income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Studio</td>
<td>$1,488</td>
<td>$4,960</td>
<td>$2,976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One bedroom</td>
<td>$1,808</td>
<td>$6,027</td>
<td>$3,616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two bedroom</td>
<td>$2,239</td>
<td>$7,463</td>
<td>$4,478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three bedroom</td>
<td>$3,042</td>
<td>$10,140</td>
<td>$6,084</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four bedroom</td>
<td>$3,720</td>
<td>$12,400</td>
<td>$7,440</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Alameda County minimum wage ranges from $13.50/hour to $16.50/hour, at full-time this is $2,335/month to $2,854/month.

Households with public benefits or Social Security have much lower incomes:
- Alameda County GA: $336/month maximum
- CalWorks/TANF: $878/month for a family of 3
- SSDI: $1,237/month average (November 2019)
- Social Security: $1,503/month national average

Income for households experiencing homelessness
- 27% of homeless households have no income
- 41% of homeless households have income of $1-1,000/month
- 15% of homeless households have income of $1,001-2,000/month
- 6% of homeless households have income of more than $2,000/month
- 11% income data missing
Trends in Poverty and Unemployment
Alameda County, 2005-2015

Source: American Community Survey, 2005-2015
Focus Group Feedback

- “It’s bad if you don’t have an average credit score even if you have got money and job. Also the application fees. If I am going to pay rent, I can’t eat or buy gas. It’s hard. On $2,000 you can’t make it. You need $3,500 because rent is $1,800 or more. You need to work 3 jobs and sell peanuts on your lunch break.” – African-American participant

- “Me my wife and daughter are all disabled and all together get $2,200 a month. I would pay 50% for housing. If I did not have to go through hoops to get into it.” – White Veteran participant
System Modeling
Adult Only Households – Current System

Self-resolvers
People w/ jobs who need short-term assistance
People who can increase income to afford rent; TAY
People w/ jobs who need subsidy to afford rent; TAY
Zero & ELI people who can't increase income; Seniors
People with disabilities who need services

Homeless Prevention / Rapid Resolution
Unsheltered, temporary housing, cycling in and out of homelessness
Rapid Re-housing
Permanent Supportive Housing

Approx. 250 PSH units available/year
Project Types Developed through the Modeling Process

Existing project types with recommended improvements
- Diversion/housing problem-solving
- Emergency shelter
- Transitional housing
- Rapid rehousing
- Permanent supportive housing

New project types
- Shallow subsidy
  - Permanent rent assistance with no or limited services
  - Usually a flat rate or a percentage of the FMR
- Dedicated affordable housing (similar to Deeply Affordable Housing in PATH Plan)
  - Housing affordable to extremely low income households experiencing homelessness
  - Rents may be set at 30% of a household’s income
  - Accessed through the homeless system so when a unit is vacant it is filled with another homeless household
  - Does not require a disability or services (although services may be available)
Next Steps
Leadership & Advancing Equity

“The old saying goes, “Actions speak louder than words.” Leaders who exemplify the change every opportunity they have, who build the new way of working into their practices, say volumes about how serious the organization is about the change.”
~ Andrea Shapiro, PhD, Creating Contagious Commitment

Monitor the system changes that will be proposed, use every opportunity to demonstrate the value of equity processes and outcomes.

Moving forward, arm yourself with a compelling case for, and highlight the dangers of not making change, that will address racial inequity.

Forge partnerships needed to buildout systems that have meaningful impacts, close racial disparities and end homelessness.